To Accreditation Council of the Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care 7.06.2022

# REPORT

# OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION ON THE RESULTS OF THE EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME IN THE SPECIALTY OF RESIDENCY <u>7R01103</u> "ALLERGOLOGY AND IMMUNOLOGY (ADULT, CHILDREN'S" OF NJSC "SEMEY MEDICAL UNIVERSITY" FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE ACCREDITATION STANDARDS FOR POSTGRADUATE PROGRAMMES (SPECIALTY OF RESIDENCY) IN MEDICAL EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTIONS

period of external expert evaluation: 23-25.05.2022

Semey, 2022

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

	List of symbols and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	3
2.	General part of the final report	4
2.1.	Presentation of the accredited organization and educational programme	4
	"Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)"	
2.2.	Information on previous accreditation	5
2.3.	Conclusion based on the results of reviewing the self-assessment report of the	
	educational programme 7R01103 "Allergology and immunology (adult,	5
	children's)" for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of postgraduate	
	education programmes (residency specialties) of medical educational	
	organizations and conclusions	
3.	Description of the external expert evaluation and conclusion	7
4.	Results of the survey of teachers and residents	11
5.	Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results	12
	of an external evaluation of the educational programme 7R01103	
	"Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)"	
6.	Recommendations for the improvement of the educational programme	22
	"Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)"	
7.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council	22
	Attachment 1. Quality profile and criteria of the external evaluation and	24
	educational programme of the residency in the specialty of the educational	
	programme "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)"	
	Attachment 2. List of documents studied as part of the external expert evaluation	25
	Attachment 3. Organization Visit programme	28

# List of symbols and abbreviations

Abbreviation	Interpretation
RoK	Republic of Kazakhstan
MoH RoK	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MES RoK	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
NJSC "SMU"	Non-profit joint-stock company "Semey Medical University"
BD	Basic disciplines
EKR	East Kazakhstan region
EEC	External expert commission
SCES	State Compulsory Educational Standard
ECAQA	Eurasian Center for Accreditation
LIS	library information system
FSA	final state attestation
Irbis	library information system
IMS	integrated management system
IEPl	Individual Educational Plan
CMS	Control and measuring system
KMIS	Kazakhstan Medical Information System
CEP	Educational Programmes Committee
LEB	Local Executive Bodies
MEP	Modular educational programme
MSF	360 Degree Rating
RW	Research work
GM	"General Medicine"
EP	Educational programme
RO	registrar's Office
ATR	assessment of tolerance rating
OSPE	objective structured practical exam
OSCE	Objective Structured Clinical Exam
PD	Profiling Disciplines
TS	Teaching staff
PD	Profiling Disciplines
WC	Working Curriculum
QMS	Quality Management System
SSS	Student Scientific Society
SU	Structural unit
TEP	Typical educational plan
TBL	Team-based-learning
SPE	School of Postgraduate Education

# 1. Composition of the external expert commission

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 17 dated 05.05.2022, an External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as EEC) was formed to conduct an external evaluation of the educational programme 7R01103 "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" in the period 23-25.05.2022, consisting of the following composition:

or der №	Status as part of EEC	Full name	Regalia, position, place of work/place of study, course, specialty		
1	chairperson	Zhanalina Bakhyt Sekerbekovna	doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Surgical and Pediatric Dentistry of NJSC "West Kazakhstan Medical University named after Marat Ospanov"		
2	Foreign Expert	Ripp Evgeny Germanovich	candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Head of the Accreditation Simulation Center of the Institute of Medical Education FSBI "National Medical Research Center named after V.A. Almazov" of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation, Member of the Board of the Russian Society for Simulation Education in Medicine (RSSTM), Member of the Programme Committee of RSSTM, Instructor of the European Council on Resuscitation (ERC)		
3	Academic Expert	Dzhandaev Serik Zhakenovich	doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Otorhinolaryngology, NJSC "Medical University of Astana", Academician of the "International Academy of Head and Neck Surgery"		
4	Academic Expert	Urazova Saltanat Nurgozhayevna	doctor of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Family Medicine No.3 of "Medical University of Astana" NJSC		
5	Academic Expert	Zhumalina Akmaral Kanashevna	doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of Children's Diseases with Neonatology of the NJSC "West Kazakhstan State Medical University named after Marat Ospanov"		
6	Academic Expert	Turgunov Yermek Meiramovich	doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Surgical Diseases of the NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda", President of the OS "Surgical Association of Karaganda Region", member of the International Surgery Society, member of the "Association of Independent Experts of Astana" and "Union of Independent Experts of KSMU"		
7	Academic Expert	Ligai Zoya Nikolaevna	doctor of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of General Medical Practice with the course of the AEMC of the NEI "Kazakh-Russian Medical University"		
8	Academic Expert	Chingaeva Gulnar Nurtasovna,	doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Clinical Disciplines of the Higher School of Medicine of NJSC "Kazakh National University named after Al-Farabi", Member of the Association of Nephrologists of Kazakhstan, Russian Dialysis Society, International Pediatric Nephrology		

9	Academic Expert	Bozhbanbayeva Nishangul Seitbekovna	Association, ISN (International Society of Nephrologists), ERA-EDTA (European Renal Association – Dialysis and Transplantation) doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Pediatric Diseases with the course of Neonatology of NJSC "Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University"			
10	Academic Expert	Ulzhan Tursunkulovna Beisebaeva	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Oncology, NJSC "Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University"			
11	Academic Expert	Doshakanova Assel Baidauletovna	candidate of Medical Sciences, Senior Lecturer of the Postgraduate Department of the Kazakh Order "Badge of Honor" Research Institute of Eye Diseases LLP			
12	Expert – employer representative	Tuleutaeva Gulnara Esenzhanovna	Organizing physician - social hygienist of the highest category, deputy chief physician of the PSE on the REM "Polyclinic No.1", Semey, EKR HCD			
13	Resident	Amina Timurovna Izmaeva	Resident of the second year of study in the specialty "Ophthalmology" of NJSC "Medical University of Astana"			

The observer for ECAQA is Umarova Makpal Aldibekovna, Head of Accreditation and Monitoring Department.

The work of the ECAQA was carried out in accordance with the Regulation of EEC (Order of the Director General of ECAQA No. 4 dated February 13, 2017).

The EEC report contains an assessment of the educational programme "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of postgraduate education programmes (residency specialties) of medical educational organizations and conclusions (hereinafter referred to as Accreditation Standards), recommendations of the EEC on further improvement of approaches and conditions for the implementation of the above-mentioned educational programme and recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

# 2. General part of the final report

2.1 Presentation of NJSC "Semey Medical University" and the educational programme "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)"

Organization name, legal form of			
ownership, BIN	BIN: 190240004938		
Management body	Board of Directors		
Full name of the chief executive	Dyusupov Altai Akhmetkalievich		
officer			
Created in	1953		
Location and contact details	071400, East Kazakhstan region, Semey, 103, Abay		
	Kunanbayev str., Tel.: 8(7222)52-22-51		
	E-mail: <u>smu@nao-SMU.kz</u>		
State license for educational	June 20, 2019		
activities in the residency (date,	No. KZ50LAA00016373		
number)			

Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care 4

Information on branches,	Pavlodar and Ust-Kamenogorsk branches
subsidiaries (if any)	2021
Year of implementation of the	2021
accredited educational programme	
(EP)	
Duration of training	2 years
Total number of graduates since the	8 graduates in 2014
beginning of EP implementation	
Number of residents on EP since the	3 trainees
beginning of the current year	
Full-time trainers/	8
Combiners involved in the	75%- Degree
implementation of EP, incl. % of	
degree	

Semey Medical University is one of the largest medical higher education institutions in the Republic of Kazakhstan, which has its own University Hospital, as well as branches in the cities of Pavlodar and Ust-Kamenogorsk. Residency programmes, being part of the educational activities of the university, strive to achieve indicators of the strategic plan of the university. Within the framework of the corporate culture, decisions on the formation of a strategic plan are made collectively in the NJSC "SMU".

High qualification of faculty -8 full-time teachers have a degree of 75%; the provision of the educational process with clinics in 2 branches and at the University Hospital for the implementation of the programme "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)", drawn up contracts on dual education between the organization of education and the Health Department provide residents with an excellent opportunity to master clinical competencies.

The first set of students in the specialty of the residency "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" was held in 2012. 8 specialists were graduated, including 1 resident on the basis of Pavlodar branch.

Almost all graduates after the end of residency are employed in medical organizations of East Kazakhstan, Pavlodar region and other regions of the Republic.

In the 2021-2022 academic year, 3 residents are studying (under the state grant, under the earmarked grant of the East Kazakhstan Regional Hospital, and at their own expense)

The residency study takes place in two main departments: 1. Department of Infectious Diseases and Immunology of NJSC "SMU". 2 Department of Personalized Medicine of Pavlodar branch of NJSC "SMU".

The staff of departments, which carries out training in the residency, has extensive experience in clinical and laboratory diagnosis and treatment of patients with allergic and immune pathology: Associate Professor, Candidate of Medical Sciences Yagofarov F.F., Candidate of Medical Sciences Kenenbayeva B.E., Candidate of Medical Sciences Kudaibergenova N.K., Candidate of Medical Sciences Kozubayeva D.B., Master of Medicine Abdrakhmanova G.Zh., Assistant Turakhanova B.S. (Chief freelance allergist of Semey).

Teachers of the department in the specialty "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" carry out a large medical work: consultations of patients in various departments of the university hospital, consultations, reception of outpatients in polyclinics of Semey and Pavlodar. The staff of the departments conduct seminars for doctors on emergency care in allergology.

# 2.2. Information on previous accreditation

The initial accreditation of the specialty "7R110500 – Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" was carried out by the Independent Agency for Quality Assurance in Education (IQAA).

On 10.06.2019, a certificate of primary accreditation (IS-A No. 0026) was obtained for a period of 5 years with annual confirmation within the framework of post-accreditation monitoring, which was carried out in 2020.

2.3 Conclusion based on the results of reviewing the self-assessment report of the educational programme 7R01103 "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of postgraduate education programmes (residency specialties) of medical educational organizations and conclusions

The self-assessment report of EP 7R01103 "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" (hereinafter – the report) is presented on 111 pages of the main text, 13 annexes on 18 pages, copies or electronic versions of 111 documents located at https://semeymedicaluniversity.kz/obuchenie/specializirovannaya-akkreditaciya/

The report is characterized by the completeness of responses to all 9 main accreditation standards and criteria, structured taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for the self-assessment of the educational programme provided to the organization of education by the accreditation center - ECAQA, as well as the internal unity of information. The report is accompanied by a cover letter signed by the Head- Chairperson of the Board - Rector A.A. Dyusupov, which confirms the reliability of quantitative information and information included in the self-assessment report.

The report contains a list of the 14 members of the internal self-assessment committee, with an indication of the responsibilities of each staff member.

The self-assessment of the educational programme "7R01103 - Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" was carried out on the basis of the order of the Chairperson of the Board - Rector of the Medical University of Semey No. 41 dated February 9, 2022 "On approval of the composition of the Working Group on self-assessment and preparation for accreditation of educational programmes of the residency for compliance with the standards of specialized accreditation of educational programmes of the Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care (ECAQA)".

The report was reviewed by S.N. Urazova, an accreditation expert, and the review noted strengths and areas for improvement, as well as recommendations for additions and changes. Thus, in the process of feedback from the representative of the educational organization, experts received answers to the questions that arose and the self-assessment report was amended accordingly and additions were made to the recommendations of the reviewers.

All the standards provide real practice for the training of residents in the specialty "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)", taking into account the beginning of student admission in 2021, reasoned data, examples of the implementation of the tasks of the EP, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. The description in the self-assessment report is sufficiently complete and updated in terms of the number of residents, teachers, administration, information on selection and admission, learning outcomes, results of knowledge and skills assessment, material and technical base of the university and clinical bases, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, bases), financial information, plans for development and improvement.

The report is submitted to ECAQA in a completed form, with correction of the data on the above recommendations, written in a competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable and described in accordance with the criterion of standards, tables and contain references in the text and have end-to-end numbering.

The quality of the self-assessment report served as the basis for moving to the next stage of the accreditation procedure, the external assessment. The experts plan to validate the report data, compare the information from the report with the information that will be obtained during the visit to the educational institution, i.e. verification of quantitative and qualitative indicators.

# **External expert evaluation assessment**

External expert work in the framework of the evaluation of the educational programme "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the External Evaluation of Educational Organizations and Educational Programmes of ECAQA (approved by the order of the Director General of the "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care" No.5 dated February 17, 2017) and in accordance with the programme approved by order No. 17 dated May 5, 2022 by the Director General of ECAQA Sarsenbayeva S.S. and agreed with the Chairperson of the Board - Rector of NJSC "SMU" Dyusupov A.A. Dates of the visit to the organization: May 23-25, 2022.

The external evaluation is aimed at validating the data of the self-assessment report and verifying the indicators indicating the degree of compliance with the criteria of accreditation standards.

The sequence of the visit within 3 days is presented in detail in the Visit Programme (hereinafter referred to as the Programme), which is contained in the documentation of the accreditation center and in Attachment 3 to this report. The programme is evidence of the implementation of all planned activities within the framework of an external expert evaluation.

To obtain objective information, the EEC members used the following methods and their results:

- interview with management and administrative staff 4 managers, administrative staff 9 people;
- interviews with residents 3 people
- study of the website https://semeymedicaluniversity.kz/obuchenie/specializirovannaya-• akkreditaciya/;
- interviewing 18 employees, 18 teachers;
- questionnaires of teachers and residents 26 and 124, respectively;
- observation of the training of residents: attendance at 1 practical lesson on the topic of "Primary immunodeficiencies", teacher: Associate Professor F.F. Yagofarov, a contingent of students - 3 residents of the 1st year of study, the venue is the University Hospital of NJSC "SMU";
- review of resources in the context of the implementation of accreditation standards: visited the practice/clinical training database of the University Hospital of NJSC "SMU", located at the address: Sechenov 1, where training is carried out on one educational programme with the participation of 5 full-time teachers;
- study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of 39 units both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the units (the list of studied documents is in Attachment 2).

The staff of the accredited organization ensures the presence of all persons indicated in the visiting programme and according to the lists of interviews and interviews (Table 1).

# Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, interviews with EEC members

N⁰	Full name	Job Title
1	F.F. Yagofarov	associate Professor of the Department of Infectious Diseases
		and Immunology of NJSC "SMU"
2	Kenenbayeva B.E.	head of the Department of Personalized Medicine of PF NJSC
		"SMU"
3	N. K. Kudaibergenova	acting Associate Professor of the Department of Infectious
		Diseases and Immunology of NJSC "SMU"
4	G.Zh. Abdakhmanova	associate Professor of the Department of Infectious Diseases
		and Immunology of NJSC "SMU"
5	Turakhanova B.S.	associate Professor of the Department of Infectious Diseases
		and Immunology of NJSC "SMU"

Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care

6	Zeynetollayeva A.R.	resident of 1 year of study in the specialty "Allergology and
		Immunology (adult, children's)"
7	Karimova Z.N.	1 year resident in the specialty "Allergology and Immunology
		(adult, children's)"
8	Kapezov N.B.	1 year resident in the specialty "Allergology and Immunology
		(adult, children's)"

In the course of the work of the EEC, a meeting was held between members of the EEC and the leadership of the NJSC "SMU", namely with the Chairperson of the Board - the Rector and Deputy Chairperson of the Board (for academic and educational work, for science and strategic development, for organizational and economic work), heads of structural units: the Dean and employees of the School of Postgraduate Education, the Chairperson and members of the CEP Residency, the head of the department of employment of graduates and the Medical Foundation, the head of the department of the clinic, the head of the department of science, the head of the department of personnel management. Interviews were conducted with heads of residency programmes, residents, teachers, employers and residency graduates. As a result of meetings and conversations, compliance with the criteria of Standard 1 was established.

All participants in the educational process know the mission of the organization, took part in the formation of proposals for the formulation of the mission, while the mission was brought to the attention of potential residents through the website, social networks, information letters to medical organizations. The strategic plan of the organization for the period of 5 years has been reviewed, which confirms the implementation of the accreditation standard and demonstrates the goals, objectives and prospects of the organization. From interviews with residents, it was established that before the beginning of classes, teachers inform about the mission, work plans of the organization of education, tell where to get the necessary information about the educational programme, teachers, training bases. This indicates compliance with **Standard 2** in terms of adapting training to the needs of residents.

The organization's documents contain educational programmes, EMCD, which define the goal, take into account the integration of practical and theoretical components, independent work. Compliance with the SCES and standard requirements has been established. Having attended the practical lesson for residents on the topic of "Primary immunodeficiencies", the experts received convincing data that the training is carried out according to the plan, before the beginning of the lesson, the residents answer tests and oral questions, receive feedback from the teacher, have the opportunity to improve the skill in the interpretation of specific laboratory studies in allergology. The organization ensures compliance with ethical aspects in the implementation of the educational programme, as experts have studied the Code of Ethics of Students (dated April 1, 2019) and during the interview, residents replied that they were informed about the contents of this document.

While attending a practical lesson on the topic and talking to residents, experts saw that the organization contributes to the development of practical competencies of residents. At the same time, residents deepen their theoretical knowledge, develop communication skills.

The analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all the achievements of science in advisory disciplines are taken into account, additions are made to the bibliography of the EP EMCD and syllabuses, and teachers apply them in classes. The residents also noted that once a month a scientific article on the diagnosis and treatment of allergic diseases and the pathology of the immune system is discussed.

The study of control and measuring tools (tests in the disciplines of EP, clinical tasks, portfolio, checklists for skills assessment) showed that the organization has introduced an appropriate evaluation policy that allows a comprehensive assessment of the educational achievements of residents. During the interview, the residents spoke about the forms of assessment, for example, working with a standardized patient in the absence of a real patient and assessing the skill on a checklist and that they are satisfied with everything. They also receive regular feedback from teachers. The system of

appealing the results of the assessment is reflected in the document "Academic Policy of the NJSC SMU" and there were no precedents for appeal during the initial period of implementation of the EP. Thus, compliance with **standard 3 has been established.** 

During the visit to the university and during the interview with the Dean of the School of Postgraduate Education Manatova A.M. and with the Chairperson of the CEP Residence Zhanaspayev M.A., information was obtained about the availability of a documentation system that is transparent and accessible to all teachers and employees, and includes such documents as an individual curriculum of residents, annual reports, provisions of divisions, contracts with teachers and residents, contracts with clinical bases, and educational and methodological documentation (educational programme, work curricula, syllabuses), evaluation tools (checklists, sheets), certificates. A review of the website showed that its pages contain the necessary documents for residents: information about the university, a list of specialties of the residency, the programme of entrance examinations, a list of documents, and information that is regularly updated.

The conversation with G.T. Nurgaliyeva, the head of the department of the clinic, included such issues as cooperation with clinical bases, the Regulation on clinical bases, the Regulation on clinical mentors, the rules of admission to the residency and allowed experts to learn about approaches to attracting clinical base staff for teaching. For example, the chief freelance allergist of East Kazakhstan region M.S. Malikova and the allergist-immunologist of Profiled Center in Pavlodar N.Zh. Kulbayeva were involved as mentors in the first year of training of residents. Questions were asked about the strategy and tactics of recruitment of residents, the information security of the educational programme, as well as to identify problems in the management and development of human resources, since part-time employees need training in teaching methods and evaluation of residents.

Interviews with 6 teachers, including 5 full-time teachers, showed that there are both successes and problems in educational management, depending on the specific base (admission of residents to the equipment, sufficient number of thematic patients, time for maintaining medical records, independent work). Experts received answers about the programme of professional development of teachers, financing of this training, availability at teachers of certification on methods of teaching.

On the same day, experts studied materials on the admission of residents and the selection of teachers and established compliance with **standard 4**.

In order to verify the data of **Standard 5**, external experts received an opinion on personnel policy and approaches to the development of teachers' pedagogical competence, motivation to work with residents, and mentoring. Experts have found that teachers initiate research topics for residents, stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature, medical documentation.

During the visit to clinical bases, a survey of resources was carried out, their compliance with training programmes, accessibility for teachers and residents, as far as this equipment is modern and meets the needs of students and practical health care. Experts obtained evidence of compliance with Standard 6, as well as validation of the information in the self-assessment report.

In order to validate the implementation of the self-assessment report and to obtain evidence on the quality of the programmes, interviews were conducted with residents in the specialty. The experts asked questions about satisfaction with the training, enough time for patient supervision, work in DAMUMED with medical documentation, satisfaction with teaching methods and qualifications of teachers, social and moral support for residents in need, participation in "Journal Clubs", accessibility of international databases of professional literature, scientific works. In general, residents are satisfied with the training, assessment methods, and purposefully entered this organization, as they believe that the organization of education has good resources, image and international relations.

Residents showed their commitment to the organization of education, were active in answering the questions of external experts, demonstrated their judgment in the organization of training, assessment of their skills, advisory support, the opportunity to participate in R&D. Experts studied the

documents of residents (portfolio, checklists, certificates of participation in conferences, joint publications with teaching staff).

Interviews with 16 employers were conducted online and included such questions as: knowledge of the university's mission, participation in the development of the mission and proposals to the strategic plan, participation in the work of advisory bodies, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of residents, participation in the training of residents through mentoring, providing the department and residents with the necessary resources for practical training and formation clinical thinking, about the problems of interaction with departments and universities in general, the percentage of employed residency graduates, etc.

The review of resources showed that they correspond to the goals and objectives of the educational programme. Experts visited the clinical base in Semey - University Hospital (multidisciplinary hospital for adults and children with 465 beds). Training of residents in the specialty "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" is held in the pediatric department of the NJSC "SMU" for 47 beds, there is also a consultative and diagnostic polyclinic, where daily reception of an allergologist-immunologist is carried out. The employees of the organization of education provide collegial and ethical relations with the medical personnel, the management of the clinical base to achieve the final results of residents. A sufficient number of thematic patients, modern equipment and demonstrates accessibility to students are provided, and employees who simultaneously perform the roles of teachers and mentors (mentors) provide high-quality training in compliance with ethics and deontology. Before starting the relevant discipline of the educational programme, the resident receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills he must acquire and develop during the training.

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of EEC members was held on the results of the external evaluation. The final discussion of the results of the external evaluation of the educational programme, the study of documents, the results of the interview, interviews, questionnaires was held. EEC members started designing the final EEC report. The results of the external evaluation are summarized. Experts individually completed the "Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational programme 7R01103 "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards". No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improving the educational programme were discussed and the Chairperson Zhanalina B.S. held a final open vote on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council for the accreditation period of 5 years.

For the work of the EEC, comfortable conditions were created, access to all the necessary information and material resources was organized. The Commission notes the high level of corporate culture of the NJSC "SMU", the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to the members of the EEC.

At the end of the programme of the visit, the chairperson of the EEC for the management and employees of the organization of education announced recommendations on the results of an external assessment within the framework of specialized accreditation.

Thus, the external evaluation and the visit of the members of the EEC allowed to verify and validate the data of the report on the self-assessment of the educational programme of the residency 7R01103 "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" in full in accordance with the Regulation on the External Expert Commission, the Guidelines for the external evaluation of the medical organization of education of the ECAQA.

#### 4. Results of the survey

An observer from the ECAQA conducted an online survey on the resource in the period 23-25.05.2022 https://webanketa.com/.

# The resident survey includes 22 questions.

In total 124 people (in total 124 residents for the current year) answered.

This university will be recommended as an organization of education - 87.9% fully agree, partially -

8.87%. 83.06% of respondents fully agree and 15.32% partially agree that programme managers and teaching staff are aware of their learning problems. Fully (75%) and partially (18.55%) satisfied with the conditions and equipment of the teaching rooms, classrooms of the university. According to 83.6% (fully) and 12.1% (partially) of office equipment is available for use on the basis of practice. Teachers provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes - fully agree 83.6%, partially – 14.52%. Fully (86.29%) and partially (8.87%) satisfied with the library collection and resources. 91.94% of respondents have access to e-learning resources and 6.45% believe that this is a partial access.

According to 81.45%, the organization of clinical training fully satisfies them, and 16.13% partially. Satisfied completely (88.71%) and partially (10.48%) with the methods of teaching. There is sufficient time for practical training (patient supervision, etc.) – 94.35% fully agree, 5.65% partially. Satisfied with the methods of assessing my knowledge and skills –92.74% completely agree, partially 7.26\%. According to 84.71% of teachers in the classroom use active and interactive teaching methods regularly, and according to 0.81% - rarely.

According to 91.94% of respondents, teachers constantly provide feedback after completing classes, but according to 4.03% - sometimes and 1.61% - rarely. Fully satisfied that they study at the university 91.13. %, partially 8.06%, disappointed-0.81% of respondents. The university allows you to improve or acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in the chosen specialty confidently 94.35%, not sure 0.81%, cannot give an answer 3.23%, would like to believe in this 0.81%, began to doubt this -0.81%. Completely (94.5 per cent) and partially (93.55 per cent) satisfied with the organization of teaching at the NJSC "SMU".

According to 85.48% of respondents, accreditation is a necessary mechanism for improving educational programmes, but 8.06% believe that it is not necessary to conduct and 5.65% doubt the answer. The work of the EEC was assessed as positive – 92.74%, satisfactory -4.84%.

The teacher survey included 21 questionnaire questions. A total of 26 people responded. The total number of respondents was 26, including 15.38% with up to 5 years of experience, 7.69 % with up to 10 years of experience, and 76.92% with over 10 years of experience. Satisfied with the organization of the educational process completely 88.46%, partially -11.54%. The university observes ethics and subordination completely agree 88.46 %, partially -11.54%. The organization of work and workplace is fully satisfied with 73.08% of respondents, partially 23.08%. In the organization there is an opportunity for career growth and competence developmenttoteachers-88,46% completely agree, partially -11.54%.

In this educational institution, teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish the results of research – fully agree 80.77%, partly 19.23%. 88,46% of respondents are completely satisfied with work of personnel service, partially-7,69%. The majority of those surveyed have undergone refresher training over the past 5 years. Only 92.31% fully agree that they can be implemented as professionals, and 7.69% - partially. Unfortunately, 7.69% did not answer the question whether the university supports the teacher in participating in international and republican events, and 30.77% did not address this to the management or relevant administrative employees of the university. The majority of respondents (96.15%) completely agree, and 3.85% partially agree that students have free access to patients on the clinical bases of the university and to the resources of the practice bases. 26.92% are unaware of the implementation of social programmes to support teachers and 3.85% of respondents are doubtful about their availability. The management and administration systematically listen to the opinionofteachers-76.92%, sometimes -0% of respondents. Various methods of teaching are used in the teaching of students, but more often work - analysis of situational problems (88.46%), work in small groups (61.54%), oral surveys and analysis of the topic (50%), also problem-oriented teaching (34.62%), solution of tests (73.08%), cases are solved (88.46%), less often written performance of tasks (7.69%). Completely according to 73.08% that this questionnaire will be useful for the development of recommendations for improving the university and educational

programmes of the residency, 19.23% partially agree with this.

The results of the survey in general demonstrate satisfaction with the educational process, the resources of the clinical base, the competencies of teachers, and also indicate the existence of centralized management of educational programmes.

5. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the educational programme 7R01103 "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)"

# Standard 1: MISSION AND END OUTCOMES

# **Evidence of compliance:**

# 1.1 Mission statement and deliverables

The specialty "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" is aimed at implementing the University's mission through the training of qualified, competitive personnel that meet modern requirements for the quality of doctors specialists for independent work in the specialty "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)".

# 1.2 Professionalism and professional autonomy

Experts received convincing data that the university is autonomous in making decisions in the development of the educational programme in terms of the component of choice, the assessment policy (current and final), including the choice of assessment methods (testing, oral survey, clinical examination), selection and admission of residents, personnel policy for teachers under the accredited educational programme, as well as the allocation of resources (classroom fund of clinical bases according to contracts).

When working with residents, training is carried out using updated protocols, treatment recommendations, own and borrowed implementations in clinical practice. Residents are required to participate (including on-line) in conferences and seminars, training seminars, symposiums, master classes.

# **1.3 Learning outcomes**

EMCD determines the final results of training in accordance with the qualification requirements for the specialty of residency. The end results include knowledge, skills, analysis, communication skills and continuous learning of the resident, which form the basis of the knowledge and skills of the allergist-immunologist. EP by its structure and methods of training forms the need to be aware of modern trends in medicine, to use evidence-based medicine data for diagnosis and effective practice of diseases, thus developing the skills of residents to lifelong learning

# 1.4 Participation in the formulation of the mission and final results

Since the EP is focused on the expectation of the employer and the needs of the labor market, coordination of the elements of the EP, CED is carried out with employers. E.Ya. Sagiyeva (Chief Freelance Allergist of Semey), A.U. Orazalina (Immunologist of Polyclinic No. 7 of Semey) were present at the discussion of the Mission of the educational programme in the specialty of residency "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" at the enlarged meeting of the department (Minutes No.1 of 31.08.2021).

In the process of creating and implementing educational programmes in the specialty, feedback from teaching staff, residents and employers is regularly carried out. At the EP, reviews were received from employers M.S. Malikova (Head of the Clinical and Diagnostic Department of the PSE on the REM City Polyclinic No.2 of Ust-Kamenogorsk HCD of East Kazakhstan region), Z.M. Smagulova (Head of the Therapeutic Department of the Pavlodar Regional Hospital named after G. Sultanov).

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Compliant with 17 standards: full – 17.

# Standard 1: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: none

# Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME

# **Evidence of compliance:**

# 2.1 Postgraduate programme framework

Accredited residency programme in the specialty "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" is implemented in accordance with the State Mandatory Standards and Standard Professional Training Programmes in Medical and Pharmaceutical Specialties dated July 31, 2015 (as amended by the Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 21, 2020 No. KR DSM-12/2020). The credit-modular system of the educational process organization has been introduced in the NJSC "SMU", which provides for: a modular structure of the educational programme; the use of credit units (credits) for assessing labor intensity; the use of point-rating systems for assessing knowledge; the participation of a resident in the formation of an individual curriculum; an increase in the share of self-study in the educational process; an increase in the flexibility of educational programmes.

## 2.2 Scientific method

During the examination of the educational programme, it was established that the scientific foundations and methodology of medical research, evidence-based medicine are applied. Involvement of residents for the implementation of small research projects and participation in the implementation of research of the department performed as part of the mastering of EP, develops the merits (qualities) of the researcher in students, teaches research methods and skills used in modern scientific practice. The implementation of these strategies is provided by a whole range of measures implemented within the framework of the classroom and extracurricular components of the EP when studying both mandatory and elective disciplines. Thus, the CED includes such disciplines as "Management of scientific research", "Biostatistics".

In addition to attracting residents to the theoretical study of modern achievements of evidencebased medicine, residents are actively involved in the description of clinical cases, the analysis of statistical material initiated by doctors of clinical bases or employees of the department. Residents of allergologists-immunologists participated in the processing of the material of the scientific article, which was published in the Russian journal "Therapist".

# 2.3 Content of the residency programme

The content, scope and sequence of the disciplines of the EP residency in the specialty "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)", strictly correspond to the SCES. At the heart of the achievement of training tasks in the specialty is the acquisition by residents of the necessary knowledge and key competencies that profiling disciplines of the main component and the component of choice (CC). The educational programme for training residents in this specialty is designed for 144 credits: core disciplines - 132 credits, a component of choice - 8 credits, interim certification - 2 credits, final certification - 2 credits. The model of competencies of residents in accordance with the qualification requirements for the specialty has been introduced. The structure, content and duration of the programme are clearly defined. The mechanism for the development and approval of the residency programme is clearly defined and regulated by the CEP.

# 2.4 Programme structure, content and duration

The structure of the EP of the Residency in the specialty 7R01103 – "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" is formed from various types of educational, scientific, clinical activities and practices that determine the content of education, reflects their ratio, measurement and accounting. The EP is implemented in accordance with the SCES of 2020 and provides the necessary level of training of residents, includes the relevant specialized disciplines.

Profiling disciplines (on 33 credits Clinical immunology and allergology in hospitals of adults and children and outpatient and polyclinic: Allergology in a polyclinic, pediatric allergology in a polyclinic – 33 credits each) - 132 credits. The EP of the programme provides a sequence of study of disciplines based on their continuity, rational distribution of disciplines by semesters from the standpoint of uniformity of the academic work of the resident.

At the same time, during interviews with university staff and residents, experts of the EEC revealed that when choosing elective disciplines, all residents are persistently offered electives relating to the management of scientific research and biostatistics. Thus, choosing only these disciplines, residents do not have the right to choose.

# 2.5 Organization of training

The personnel of the department has the necessary competencies for training residents. Teachers of departments use various methods of active (business games, brainstorming, clinical debriefing, case-studies, etc.) and traditional (oral debriefing, mini-lectures) training, according to which staff members periodically study within the university, less often in other organizations. The Residency Department and the Postgraduate Education of CEP constantly monitor this process and train newly recruited employees through the School of Young Teachers.

At the clinical sites, the resident can get the maximum access to patients according to his profile of the residency educational programme. When drawing up the staffing table for the new academic year, for conducting classes for residents, the mandatory requirement for teachers is the presence of an academic degree, academic title and work experience. A clinical mentor is appointed from among qualified specialized specialists with at least five years of experience in the main activity.

# 2.6 Relationship between postgraduate medical education and health care

Due to the availability of clinical facilities for residents (hospitals of therapeutic and pediatric profile, polyclinics of the cities of Semey, Ust-Kamenogorsk and Pavlodar), they spend most of their teaching time in close contact with patients, medical documentation, including automated health care systems. Mentors have been training residents since the last one. Patient supervision allows residents to master diagnostic and treatment procedures in the course of daily clinical activities. Multidisciplinary clinics have a broad profile of departments and emergency conditions, which allows residents to see and supervise a sufficient number of patients with a variety of pathologies corresponding to the cycle of disciplines.

When conducting interviews with residents, experts made sure that the organization of training and work is patient-oriented, at the same time, there is not always a sufficient number of thematic patients, time for theoretical analyses of complex topics and study of literature in modern databases.

Thus, the educational programme of the residency in the specialty "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" demonstrates the integration between training and the provision of medical care.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Compliant with 30 of the standards: fully – 29, partially -1

# Standard 2: Implemented

# **Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

1) To provide residents with an alternative choice of elective disciplines in the specialty of the educational programme (2.4.2).

# Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS Evidence of compliance:

# **3.1 Methods of evaluation**

The policy and procedure for assessing the results of training within the framework of the EP is carried out using criteria developed in accordance with the goals and objectives set for the implementation of the EP and the qualifications assigned within the framework of the current point-rating system for assessing knowledge and monitoring the educational process in accordance with policy, regulatory and internal documents.

The general policy, principles, methods of assessment of residents in the specialty 7R01103 – "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" in NJSC "SMU" are reflected in the "Academic Policy for 2021-2022" dated 31.08.2021). The responsibility for the implementation of the policy on

assessing the educational achievements of residents is borne by the faculty of the department, the head of the department (modules), the registrar's office.

To ensure maximum objectivity and transparency of the evaluation process, the department has developed checklists for conducting current, intermediate and final control of the discipline (MinicEX, CbD, OSCE). As an additional method of evaluating residents, portfolios are used, which experts familiarized themselves with at the departments supervising the residency programme.

# 3.2 Relationship between evaluation and training

The methods used to assess the competencies of students at NJSC "SMU" are defined in syllabuses on disciplines that are discussed and approved at departmental meetings, the CEP, the Academic Committee, the Academic Council.

It has been established that assessment methods are comparable to teaching and learning methods and cover the assessment of all competencies of students both during practical classes and during examinations. The assessment of educational achievements uses various types of control and measuring tools developed by the departments (control questions, tasks in test form, situational tasks, practical and communicative skills, etc.).

The procedure for planning, organizing, monitoring and evaluating evaluation methods ensures the reliability and validity of these methods. The development of new control and measuring tools is carried out by teachers through the study of world experience in the assessment of knowledge in the residency, then implemented at the department.

The conclusions of the EEC meet the criteria of 11 standards: 11 in full. Standard 3: Implemented

# Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: none

Standard 4: STUDENTS Evidence of compliance:

# 4.1 Admission and Selection Policy

During the visit, the EEC experts established that admission to the residency in NJSC "SMU" is carried out in accordance with the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 No. 600 "On approval of the Standard Rules for admission to training in educational institutions that implement educational programmes of higher and postgraduate education". The conditions for admission of students are prescribed in the "Regulations on admission of students to higher and postgraduate education in NJSC "SMU". The criteria for applicants entering the residency are determined by the requirements of the State Standard of Education and Training of the Republic of Kazakhstan, according to which the previous level of education of persons wishing to master the educational programmes of the residency: basic medical education, higher medical education, internship.

Questions about admission to residency educational programmes are posted on the university's website <u>https://semeymedicaluniversity.kz/postuplenie/pravila-priema/</u> and in the admission commission.

## 4.2 Number of residents

EEC experts confirmed that the procedure for determining the number of admitted students of the residency in the specialty "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" is regulated by the State Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan for the training of medical personnel and taking into account the possibilities of clinical, practical training, the maximum permissible load on curators, the availability of educational, methodological and scientific literature, the capacity of clinical bases, as well as material and technical resources of the university.

At the university there is a practice of organizing targeted training in residency. Medical organizations of East Kazakhstan and Pavlodar regions have the opportunity to send targeted grants to the university for the education of specific residents.

## 4.3 Resident support and advice

Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care 15

In NJSC "SMU", a system of academic consulting of residents is built, when each resident is assigned a curator from among the faculty members of the department. In addition, the resident is assigned a clinical mentor in the medical organization where the resident is trained. Its function is to direct the resident to master the practical skills and competencies necessary for the resident in the process of his training, which is reflected in the Academic Policy of NJSC "SMU".

In the event of a professional crisis or disagreement in principle with the supervisor or colleagues, the resident is supported by the Resident Council.

The university has a department of youth policy, which is able to provide socio-psychological support through resident colleagues, as well as professional advice from a sociologist-psychologist who provides assistance in cases of professional crisis, as well as other emergency situations with residents.

#### **4.4 Representation of residents**

EEC experts confirmed that residents participate in the meetings of collegial bodies where they are official members and express their opinions and proposals for improvement. A feedback analysis is carried out in the form of a survey of graduates of the residency and employers, on the basis of which the process of policy development and selection of residents in the specialties of the residency is improved. EEC experts also confirmed that the participation of students at all levels in the quality of the educational process is regulated by the Academic Policy of NJSC "SMU" dated August 31, 2021.

# 4.5 Working conditions

In accordance with the current agreements with clinical bases, Cl. 7 (27.4) "The Clinic undertakes to ensure the admission of students to patients and to all structural units of the Clinic, including the basic departments, the operating unit, the intensive care unit, the intensive care unit in accordance with the needs of the educational process, except for cases when the admission of students to the treatment process is not allowed by the current legislation and / or the requirements of patients".

Students under EP 7R01103 - "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" have the opportunity to participate in weekly clinical rounds, consultations, medical councils on clinical bases both as listeners and as speakers. Actively participate in holding Open Days, health schools on clinical bases. Resident doctors are granted holidays between academic periods. The duration of the holidays during the school year is at least 5 weeks, with the exception of the final year. The right to combine training with work (no more than 0.5 hours) in areas of activity close to his future specialty in his free time from study with the consent of the supervisor, the head of the department and the head of the residency department.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Compliant with 30 standards: full – 30. Standard 4: Implemented Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: none

#### **Standard 5: FACULTY**

#### **Evidence of compliance:**

#### **5.1 Recruitment and Selection Policy**

The University has developed and approved the "Personnel Policy of the NJSC SMU", approved on 10.03.2018 and updated the Regulation on the Personnel Policy of the NJSC "SMU" dated 30.09.2019, which reflects the priorities for the formation of human resources and selection criteria, including the scientific, pedagogical and clinical merits of candidates.

The University pays great attention to the selection and recruitment of qualified personnel, as well as their training. The selection and recruitment of employees is carried out by competitive selection in accordance with the established requirements.

The faculty is formed on the basis of the requirements for the effective implementation of educational programmes, as well as on the basis of the total amount of study load. The faculty members of the department are constantly improving their qualifications.

The University improves the selection of personnel to achieve its mission and goals, incentives

for personnel, taking into account their scientific, clinical and pedagogical merits, promotions, awards and rewards.

## 5.2 Teachers' obligations and development

When visiting the experts of the Department and during the conversation with the faculty, it was confirmed that the management of NJSC "SMU" in accordance with the needs to improve the level of teaching, improve the final results of training, increases the material and technical base for improving the qualification level and scientific potential of faculty conducting training in the residency. To carry out this task, the University has the following units: the School of the Young Teacher, the Department of Additional and Non-Formal Education, which contribute to the formation and enhancement of the competencies and potential of the teaching staff.

When studying the documentation and during the interview, the experts of the EEC found that mentors improve their qualifications at the "School of Clinical Mentor". However, it turned out that the proposed topics relate only to communication skills. There was no confirmation of the training of pedagogical competencies, given that clinical mentors are mainly representatives of practical health care.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Compliant with 7 standards: fully – 6, partially – 1. *Standard 5: Implemented* 

## Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) Provide an advanced training programme at the "School of clinical mentor" with basic pedagogical competencies (5.2.2)

# **Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES**

# **Evidence of compliance:**

#### **6.1 Logistics and equipment**

During the visit and interview, EEC experts made sure that NJSC "SMU" has sufficient infrastructure necessary for the successful implementation of the OP Residence "7R01103-Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" with the use of material and technical base, information resources and technologies, resources for clinical training.

The material and technical base of the university includes: lecture halls, study rooms, the Center for Research Laboratory, library, clinical bases of East Kazakhstan region and Pavlodar. Ensuring the working environment conditions is carried out in accordance with the accepted sanitary norms and safety rules of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The study rooms are equipped with multimedia equipment, educational material in electronic form, methodological developments for each discipline. This makes it possible to ensure that the educational process is conducted in accordance with educational standards.

## **6.2 Clinical Bases**

Clinical bases for residents studying in the specialty "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" are the leading clinics of East Kazakhstan region and Pavlodar region

<u>Semey:</u> University Hospital (with a total bed capacity of 465 beds): includes a paediatric department of NJSC "SMU" for 47 beds, a consultative and diagnostic polyclinic of NJSC "SMU", where a daily reception of an allergist-immunologist is held. Kidney center in Semey, toxicology department for 10 beds. PSE on the REM "Polyclinic Harmony", where there is an allergic cabinet with skin tests and allergen-specific immunotherapy (ASIT)

<u>Ust-Kamenogorsk:</u> City Hospital No. 4, Ust-Kamenogorsk, allergy department for 20 beds. PSE on the REM "Center for Mother and Child" HCD EKR, a pediatric department for 40 beds, an advisory polyclinic of the pediatric unit.

<u>Pavlodar</u>: Pavlodar regional hospital named after G. Sultanov, therapeutic department for 30 beds, consultative and diagnostic polyclinic with an allergist. "Pavlodar Children's Regional Hospital" PSE on the REM, somatic department for 30 beds, allergic clinic for pediatric allergist.

The equipment of clinical bases contributes to the high-quality organization of the educational process and the provision of specialized and highly specialized inpatient and outpatient polyclinic assistance to the population.

# **6.3 Information technology**

EEC experts confirm that information support for the work of residents in the specialty "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" is carried out through the websitehttps://semeymedicaluniversity.kz, which is conducted in three languages (state, Russian and English). To maximize access to the media, the university actively maintains official pages on social networks: (https://www.facebook.com/semeymedicaluniversity); Facebook Twitter (https://twitter.com/SSMUofficial); Instagram (https://www.instagram.com/SemeyMedicalUniversity); (https://www.youtube.com/user/SemeyStateMedicalUni); Youtube Vkontakte (https://vk.com/semeymedicaluniversity).

The university provides free access to students, faculty and staff to the Internet and Wi-Fi throughout the university. All departments, structural units, halls of electronic resources, hostels are connected to the Internet network. There are 2 interactive classes for working with multimedia content.

To organize the educational process, all teachers and students have access to electronic platforms. As a tool, video tutorials and instructions on the use of UpToDate subscription electronic resources, Cochrane Library, were used.

# **6.4 Clinical Teams**

During the interviews and the visit to the clinical base, the experts of the EEC made sure that the training programme for residents in the specialty 7R01103 - "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" includes the skills of working in a team and effective interaction with other health care specialists. Residents together with the staff of clinical bases work out skills of professionalism in all spheres of their activity: participation in selector republican and city meetings, in scientific and practical conferences, work in multidisciplinary teams.

The department provides training for residents in an interdisciplinary team by conducting master classes, classes in the form of a "standardized patient", team-oriented training, clinical debriefings, pathology conferences.

# 6.5 Medical Research and Advances

The scientific interests of the employees of the Department of Infectious Diseases and Immunology are determined by the profile of the clinical base and the specialty. The participation of residents in research work contributes to the expansion of their horizons, the acquisition of skills to work independently with scientific literature, the organization and conduct of experiments, the acquisition of skills in servicing a patient, the establishment of a diagnosis, the justification of methods of effective treatment. Theoretical and practical issues of diagnosis and treatment of allergic diseases and immune pathology are the priority areas of research of the department staff. EEC experts confirm that the result of the work is the publication of residents together with a teacher, making presentations at conferences.

# **6.6 Education expertise**

Examination of the quality of the implemented EP residency is a mandatory stage of the educational process and is carried out by the following structures of NJSC "SMU": Committee of Educational Programmes (CEP) (planning, development and evaluation of EP), Academic Committee (approval of EP), School of Postgraduate Education (implementation of EP).

The procedure for examination in the field of education regarding the planning, implementation and evaluation of the educational programme is presented in the Regulation on the development, approval and examination of educational programmes of NJSC "SMU".

At the same time, EEC experts noted that the innovative teaching methods being implemented were not reflected in the submitted documents in the form of formalized acts on their introduction into the educational process.

# 6.7 Training in other institutions

Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care 18

Experts of EEC found that the organization and implementation of academic mobility in the University is carried out by the Department of Strategic Development and International Cooperation, which is actively working to establish partnerships with Kazakh and foreign universities. The university defines the procedure for organizing academic mobility, which is formulated in the "Regulations on the academic mobility of students, teachers and employees".

Distance cycles have been announced for residents of the Semey Medical University within the framework of the academic mobility programme at the Ryazan State Medical University named after Academician I.P. Pavlov.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Compliant with 21 standards: fully - 20, partially - 1 *Standard 6: Implemented* 

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:** 

1) It is necessary to document the innovative teaching methods used in the educational process (6.6.2)

#### Standard 7: PROGRAMME EVALUATION Evidence of compliance:

#### 7.1 Monitoring and evaluation mechanisms

Monitoring and evaluation of EP includes the following stages: discussion, review, revision taking into account proposals and comments made by employers and other stakeholders, recommendation for approval, approval procedure.

Improvement of the procedure for evaluating the programme at the level of the university, the School of Postgraduate Education, departments is carried out through discussion of the context of the programme and special disciplines at the meetings of the CEP Residency and the Academic Committee. One of the important conditions for continuous monitoring and improving the quality of the educational process is the correction of EP on the basis of feedback with the participation of stakeholders (teachers, students, employers and other stakeholders).

The process of continuous improvement of teaching staff is implemented on the basis of: improving the qualification of teaching staff every 5 years, the participation of teaching staff at student events (seminars, master classes, conferences), understanding of their own experience in the introduction of pedagogical technologies in the educational process, the exchange of experience in the introduction of pedagogical technologies, management processes of teaching staff.

# 7.2 Feedback from teachers and residents

Teachers and residents have the opportunity to participate in the assessment and subsequent improvement of EP on a regular basis through various channels of feedback (through questionnaires (LMS keyps, Google forms), organization of focus groups, constant monitoring of appeals to the blog of the chairperson of the board – the rector, his deputies, deans, opening the box for written appeals). Confirmation of the effectiveness of the education received is also based on the results of feedback - an annual survey of students to assess the level of satisfaction with educational programmes. As a result of the questionnaire analysis, changes and additions are made to the EP.

# 7.3 Results of Residents and Graduates

The Residence Department collects feedback from students to determine the level of satisfaction with the content of the EP, the organization of the educational process in the form of a questionnaire, monitoring of appeals to the rector's blog, discussion of current issues in the social network. The survey of graduates of the residency of the EP "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" is also carried out annually (questionnaires are developed and approved)

#### 7.4 Stakeholder Engagement

The university's governance system involves all stakeholders, including the health sector, and reflects the responsibility of academic leadership. This is confirmed by feedback and reviews from employers on the EP. Employers and practitioners are regularly involved in the development of new educational programmes; in the development and discussion of the expected learning outcomes; in the

assessment of the actual learning outcomes of students and graduates.

Representatives of practical health care, employers are obligatory members of the examination commission of the state certification of graduates. Representatives of practical health care, who have extensive experience, are clinical mentors of residents, which also makes it possible for other stakeholders to participate in the implementation of the educational programme in the specialty "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)".

Taking into account the needs of practical health care and the recommendations of employers, the catalog of elective disciplines includes electives on "Molecular allergic diagnosis" and "Peculiarities of the course of allergies in the context of the COVID-19 pandemic".

# 7.5 Procedure for Approval of Educational Programmes

A mechanism for the approval of educational programmes has been developed at NJSC "SMU". The CEP carries out a systematic study and comprehensive assessment of EP in order to improve and guarantee quality (determining the value of the programme, achieving the goal, achieving tasks, the degree of compliance with the needs of society, the requirements of employers, the effectiveness of the training methodology), as well as an assessment of the educational and methodological support and support of the educational process. The EP is approved at the meeting of the Chair, the CEP and the Academic Council.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 15 standards: fully – 15. Standard 7: Implemented Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

# Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION Evidence of compliance:

# 8.1 Management

In the implementation of postgraduate education, NJSC "SMU" is guided by the Laws of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education", "On approval of the state educational order for the training of specialists with higher and postgraduate education", the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On approval of the rules for placing a state order, admission to training and training of medical personnel in residency", Standard rules for admission to training in educational organizations, state residencies, which regulate the number of state educational orders for the training of residents in the field of healthcare.

# 8.2 Academic Leadership

The Academic Policy, which regulates in detail the rights, obligations and responsibilities of students and the University administration, the procedure for organizing the educational process, is annually reviewed and approved in the NJSC "SMU". These rules stipulate the officials responsible for the proper implementation of the Rules and the scope of their responsibility.

# 8.3 Training budget and resource allocation

The budget of NJSC "SMU" is formed from two sources: the republican budget (state order for training of personnel of higher and postgraduate education, advanced training of medical workers, development of scientific research, transfers) and provision of paid educational services.

For the 2021-2022 academic year, 1 place was allocated under the State Educational Order for the training of medical personnel in the residency in the specialty Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's). Also, 2 residents are trained under the targeted grant of the East Kazakhstan regional hospital, and at their own expense.

# 8.4 Administration and Management

Every year, changes and additions are made to the organizational structure of NJSC "SMU". The staffing table of departments providing educational programmes of the residency is approved annually taking into account changes in the number of students. According to Art.52 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education" dated 27.07.2007. No. 319-SH, the total number of faculty members is formed on the basis of an average ratio of residents and teachers – 3:1. The University has defined the

general strategy, main directions, priorities and objectives of the University's policy in the field of improving the quality of education in accordance with the University's mission, vision and development programme.

# **8.5 Requirements and regulations**

The Regulation on Residency was developed in accordance with the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education", the Concept for the Development of Medical Education and determines the procedure for training medical personnel in the Residency in the organizations of medical education and science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, regardless of the forms of ownership, having a license for this type of educational activity and clinical bases.

On the issues of training of residents, NJSC "SMU" closely cooperates with the Department of Science and Human Resources of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Republican Center for Health Development of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Quality control of the educational programmes of the residence of NJSC "SMU" by the authorized body (Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan) is carried out at the time of audits, during which the degree of compliance of the learning process in the residence with the requirements of the NPA is revealed.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 15 standards: fully – 15. Standard 8: Implemented Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: none

## Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL Evidence of compliance:

In order to continuously improve the postgraduate educational process in accordance with the best practice of world educational management, taking into account the needs of practical health care of the Republic of Kazakhstan, NJSC "SMU" regularly initiates the review and updating of processes. The school of postgraduate education and the quality control department of medical education constantly monitor the implementation of EP on the basis of collecting and analyzing feedback from graduates of the residency and from employers through questionnaires; organizing "focus groups"; collecting and analyzing feedback from residents. Based on the results of feedback from the DQCME on the satisfaction with the quality of the educational process and the assessment of disciplines, a plan of measures is drawn up to improve the results.

As a result of updating and continuous adjustment, in order to harmonize the projected learning outcomes and actually formed competencies, the needs of society, the economy, the labor market, the results of educational activities and feedback from stakeholders, the content of both mandatory and elective disciplines is annually adjusted, the results of teacher training are introduced. Regularly reviewed taking into account changes in the external environment and the requirements of the labor market of the CED. Elective disciplines of the profiling cycle take into account the latest changes in the labor market, reflect the interests of the employer, and together with all types of practices are aimed at preparing for professional activity.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 4 standards: fully - 4. Standard 9: Implemented Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: none

# 6. Recommendations for the improvement of the educational programme 7R01103 "Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)"

1. To provide residents with an alternative choice of elective disciplines in the specialty of the educational programme (2.4.2).

2. Provide an advanced training programme at the "School of clinical mentor" with basic pedagogical competencies (5.2.2)

3. It is necessary to document the innovative teaching methods used in the educational process (6.6.2)

# 7. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

The members of the EEC came to a unanimous opinion to recommend to the Accreditation Council to accredit the educational programme "7R01103 - Allergology and Immunology (adult, children's)" of the Non-profit Joint Stock Company "SEMEY MEDICAL UNIVERSITY", which meets the Standards of accreditation of educational programmes of the residency of medical educational organizations for a period of 5 years.

Chairperson of the External Expert Commission Zhanalina Bakhyt Sekerbekovna Foreign expert (online) **Ripp Evgeny Germanovich** National Academic Expert Zhumalina Akmaral Kanashevna National Academic Expert Turgunov Ermek Meiramovich National Academic Expert Dzhandaev Serik Zhakenovich National Academic Expert Urazova Saltanat Nurgozhayevna National Academic Expert Ligai Zoya Nikolaevna National Academic Expert Chingaeva Gulnar Nurtasovna National Academic Expert Bozhbanbayeva Nishangul Seitbekovna National Academic Expert Beisebayeva Ulzhan Tursunkulovna National Academic Expert Doshakanova Asel Baidauletovna Expert - representative of employers Tuleutaeva Gulnara Yesenzhanovna Resident representative Expert (online) Izmayeva Amina Timurovna

# Attachment 1.

	(generalization	Í	Estimation			
Standard	Evaluation Criteria	Number of standards	Fully compliant	Partially compliant	Not compliant	
1	MISSION AND END OUTCOMES	17	17			
2	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME	30	29	1		
3	ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS	11	11			
4	STUDENTS	30	30			
5	FACULTY	7	6	1		
6	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES	21	20	1		
7	PROGRAMME EVALUATION	15	15			
8	GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION	15	15			
9	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL	4	4			
	Subtotal:	150	147	3		
			150			

Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational programme (generalization)